# IMPROVEMENT OF THE EFFECTIVE JUDICIAL PROTECTION OF TAXPAYERS IN SPAIN IN THE LIGHT OF COMPARATIVE LAW



GOBIERNO DEL PRINCIPADO DE ASTURIAS PhD Candidate: Estefanía Álvarez Menéndez alvarezestefania@uniovi.es

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Isabel García-Ovies Sarandeses







## SPAIN

Tribunal Supremo (TS)

Tribunal Superior de Justicia (TSJ)

Appeal on points of law
Until 22 July 2016: > EUR 600,000
After 22 July 2016: Fundamental significance

First and last instance (excluding local taxes)
TSJ also rules on appeals on points of fact and law against
judgements of JCA (>EUR 30,000)

Juzgados ContenciosoAdministrativos (JCA)

First instance (local taxes)

## **COMMON LAW**

#### **ENGLAND**

Audiencia Nacional (AN)

(Excluding Tax Credits and Council Tax)

Supreme Court

Permission to appeal on points of law (general public importance)

#### **Court of Appeal**

Permission to appeal on points of law

Test second-Tier: important point of principle or practice, or compelling reasons

Upper Tribunal (Tax and Chancery Chamber) Permission to appeal on points of law

First-tier Tribunal (Tax Chamber)

## **USA (FEDERAL SYSTEM)**

Before payment Aft

Supreme Court (writ of certiorari)

US Courts of Appeals

Tax Court Co

After payment

Supreme Court (writ of certiorari)

US Courts of Appeals

Appeals for the Federal Circuit

**US Court of** 

District Courts

US Court of Federal Claims

At the choice of the taxpayer

## **CIVIL LAW**

#### FRANCE

Conseil d'Etat

(Appeal on points of law: serious grounds)

Cours administratives d'appel

(Second instance: excluding most of local taxes)

### Tribunaux administratifs

(First instance: direct taxation,taxes sur le chiffre d'affaires or similar taxes (VAT and others)

#### -

Cour de Cassation

(Appeal on points of law)

Cours d'appel

(Second instance)

#### Tribunal de Grande Instance

(First instance: registration, stamp duties. indirect taxes or similar taxes)

#### GERMANY

#### Bundesfinanzhof

(Appeal on points of law: fundamental significance, development of law/uniformity of jurisprudence or procedural shortcoming)

**Finanzgerichte** (First instance)

- Successful preliminary administrative complaint
  - Local taxes: see also VwGO

## **PORTUGAL**

\*Fiscal jurisdiction stricto sensu

#### Supremo Tribunal Administrativo (Secção de contencioso tributário)

(Second instance - minimum amount: only grounds of law)

(Appeal on points of law: fundamental significance/ implementation of law)

Tribunais Centrais Administrativos (Secção de contencioso tributário)

(Second Instance - minimum amount: grounds of fact or grounds of fact and law)

Tribunais Tributários (First instance)

#### **ITALY**

Corte Suprema di Cassazione (Appeal on points of law)

Commissioni Tributarie Regionali (Second instance)

## Commissioni Tributarie Provinciali

(First instance)

\*Its judgements can be appealed (per saltum) to the «Corte Suprema di Cassazione» (if agreement and breach of law)

## PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVING THE SPANISH JURISDICTION OVER TAX MATTERS

- Generalization of first instance before JCA and, as far as possible, second instance before TSJ or AN
  - Establishment of tax courts or tax chambers within administrative courts
  - ADR and improvement of the preliminary administrative complaint (German model)